

# Recommendations for the Fourth Cycle of the Universal Periodic Review of Turkmenistan:

April 2023

Submitted by:  
**Crude Accountability (CA)**

## **CRUDE ACCOUNTABILITY**

**Crude Accountability**

P.O. Box 423,  
Linden, VA  
22642  
USA

<https://crudeaccountability.org/>  
[info@crudeaccountability.org](mailto:info@crudeaccountability.org).  
[kate@crudeaccountability.org](mailto:kate@crudeaccountability.org)

### **Information about Submitting Organization**

Crude Accountability is a nonprofit (501-c-3) organization, established in 2003, focused on the intersection of environmental and human rights. Our focus areas are the Black Sea, the Caspian Sea, and other regions of Eurasia affected by oil and natural gas development. We are committed to the principles of transparency, cooperation, and scientific inquiry. We utilize these principles, in conjunction with our local partners, to assess and analyze the impacts of the oil and natural gas sectors on local communities, state politics, environment, climate, and transnational corruption. Crude Accountability works with local communities and on the international level for a just and sustainable world in which environmental and human rights are respected by companies, governments, and international institutions. Crude Accountability is a founding member of the Prove They Are Alive! campaign, which strives to end the practice of enforced disappearances in Turkmenistan, and advocates on behalf of the disappeared and their families. Since 2013, the Prove They Are Alive! campaign has collected information about enforced disappearances in Turkmenistan, advocating with the UN Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances, the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) and its member states, and with national governments.

### **Introduction**

## 1. Summary of Key Concerns from 2018-2023

1.1 For two decades, Turkmenistan has used enforced disappearances as a systemic means of torture and intimidation of its citizens. The “Prove They Are Alive!” campaign<sup>1</sup> has documented<sup>2</sup> 162 cases of enforced disappearances in Turkmenistan. This is not a historic practice, but rather one that continues in the present day.

1.2 Of the 162 individuals forcibly disappeared, 96 are considered by the Prove They Are Alive! campaign to be cases of continued disappearances. Of these 96, 71 are current, meaning we believe they are still incarcerated and without contact with the outside world. The other 25 are in question because of a lack of verifiable information from the government of Turkmenistan. Of the remaining 66 out of the 162 individuals, 29 individuals have died in custody, 10 have been released, and 30 continue to serve their sentences but with food parcels and family visitations.<sup>3</sup>

1.3 32 of the 96 current cases include individuals who have served their full prison sentence but have not been released and continue to be forcibly disappeared by the Turkmenistani government.<sup>4</sup> The UN Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances (WGEID) issued three communications regarding these cases between 2017-2018, highlighting the cases of Batyr Berdyev, Rustem Djumaev, and Serdar Rakhimov.<sup>5</sup> The government of Turkmenistan has not responded in any substantive way to the WGEID communications.

1.4 The WGEID issued three further communications to the Turkmenistani government regarding cases of enforced disappearances since the third cycle Universal Periodic Review. These cases are described below:

1.5 In 2018, the WGEID issued a communication about the case of Annamurad Atdaev,<sup>6</sup> who was forcibly disappeared in December 2016 for alleged membership in an Islamic extremist group after he refused to inform the government of Turkmenistan about the activities of his fellow students at his university in Egypt. His wife, Daria Atdaeva, a Russian citizen, attempted to see her husband in prison but was denied access. She later faced reprisals from the Russian authorities and was forced to flee the country and is now seeking asylum in Europe.<sup>7</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> <https://provetheyarealive.org/>

<sup>2</sup> [https://provetheyarealive.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Disappeared-in-Turkmenistans-prisons\\_report\\_Prove\\_November-2021\\_final.pdf](https://provetheyarealive.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Disappeared-in-Turkmenistans-prisons_report_Prove_November-2021_final.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [https://provetheyarealive.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Disappeared-in-Turkmenistans-prisons\\_report\\_Prove\\_November-2021\\_final.pdf](https://provetheyarealive.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Disappeared-in-Turkmenistans-prisons_report_Prove_November-2021_final.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> See attached appendix on the thirty-two

<sup>5</sup> Ibid, pg. 4.

<sup>6</sup> <https://spcommreports.ohchr.org/TMResultsBase/DownloadPublicCommunicationFile?gId=24207>

<sup>7</sup> [https://provetheyarealive.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Disappeared-in-Turkmenistans-prisons\\_report\\_Prove\\_November-2021\\_final.pdf](https://provetheyarealive.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Disappeared-in-Turkmenistans-prisons_report_Prove_November-2021_final.pdf), pg. 52-53.

1.6 In 2019, the WGEID issued a communication regarding the “alleged enforced disappearances and deaths in custody of at least 27 individuals due to torture, inhumane treatment, degrading detention conditions, and denial of medical assistance in the Turkmen prison system, in particular at the maximum-security prison Ovadan Depe.” The communication regarded 121 cases of enforced disappearances in Turkmenistan, and 27 related deaths, since 2006. Among these is the case of Ms. Ogulsapar Karlievna Muradova, a human rights defender who was forcibly disappeared in June 2006.<sup>8</sup> Ms. Muradova died in custody, allegedly of torture, although the government of Turkmenistan denied any wrongdoing. In 2018, the UN Human Rights Committee found the government of Turkmenistan responsible for the torture and death in custody of Ms. Muradova.<sup>9</sup> As recently as March 2, 2023, the government of Turkmenistan, in official dialogue with the UN Human Rights Committee, stated that Ms. Muradova had committed suicide in prison.<sup>10</sup>

1.7 In 2021, the WGEID, in tandem with the UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention, the Special Rapporteur on the Situation of Human Rights Defenders, and the Special Rapporteur on Promotion and Protection of the Right to Freedom of Opinion and Expression issued a communication to the Turkmenistani government concerning the case of Mr. Nurgeldi Halykov, a journalist and human rights defender who was disappeared in July 2020.<sup>11</sup>

## 2. Unimplemented Recommendations

2.1 The Turkmenistani government has done little to implement the recommendations related to enforced disappearances put forth by the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review for Turkmenistan in September 2018<sup>12</sup> and those of the Prove They Are Alive submission to the UPR in September 2017.<sup>13</sup> The Turkmenistani government maintains that they consistently implement reviews of legislation to bring domestic and international law into congruency, that torture is strictly forbidden under Turkmenistani law,<sup>14</sup> and that international and domestic

<sup>8</sup> <https://spcommreports.ohchr.org/TMResultsBase/DownloadPublicCommunicationFile?gld=24959>

<sup>9</sup> <https://tmhelsinki.org/en/article/e67890c0-7123-4028-86bb-3925864aff73>, and [https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/\\_layouts/15/TreatyBodyExternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CCPR%2fC%2f122%2fd%2f2252%2f2013&Lang=en](https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/TreatyBodyExternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CCPR%2fC%2f122%2fd%2f2252%2f2013&Lang=en), accessed March 29, 2023.

<sup>10</sup> <https://www.ungeneva.org/en/news-media/meeting-summary/2023/03/dialogue-turkmenistan-experts-human-rights-committee-praise>

<sup>11</sup> <https://spcommreports.ohchr.org/TMResultsBase/DownloadPublicCommunicationFile?gld=26006>

<sup>12</sup> <https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G18/207/39/PDF/G1820739.pdf?OpenElement>

<sup>13</sup> [http://provetheyarealive.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/SUBMISSION-UPR\\_Turkmenistan\\_2017\\_Prove-They-Are-Alive.pdf](http://provetheyarealive.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/SUBMISSION-UPR_Turkmenistan_2017_Prove-They-Are-Alive.pdf)

<sup>14</sup> These comments are derived from the Third periodic report submitted by Turkmenistan under article 19 of the Convention, due in 2020, submitted under the Convention against Torture. [https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/\\_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en](https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en), para. 28, para. 58, and para. 185.

See also

<https://www.ohchr.org/en/news/2023/03/dialogue-turkmenistan-experts-human-rights-committee-praise-measures-review-judicial>

organizations, such as the Ombudsperson, UN bodies, the OSCE, and the International Committee of the Red Cross, have direct access to the Turkmenistani prisons.<sup>15</sup> The reality is far from these statements.

2.2 While claiming that the government of Turkmenistan has done much to bolster and maintain human rights in the country,<sup>16</sup> the Turkmenistani response in 2020 is untrue with regard to the status of human rights protected under Turkmenistani law and gives little to no consideration to the systemic issue of enforced disappearances within the country. Notably, no information is shared about the infamous Ovadan Depe prison complex, which houses the majority of those forcibly disappeared by the government, or about the cases of thirty-two individuals who have served their terms and yet remain forcibly disappeared in the Turkmenistani prison system.<sup>17</sup>

### 3. UN and Participating State Recommendations

3.1 In September 2018, the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review of Turkmenistan presented eighteen recommendations that we have indicated are directly related to the issue of enforced disappearances. None of these recommendations have been implemented by the Turkmenistani state.

---

<sup>15</sup> These comments are derived from the Third periodic report submitted by Turkmenistan under article 19 of the Convention, due in 2020, submitted under the Convention against Torture. [https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/\\_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en](https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en), para. 26, para. 135, para. 136, para. 137, para. 139, para. 140, para. 176, para. 177, para. 179, and para. 180.

See also

<https://www.ohchr.org/en/news/2023/03/dialogue-turkmenistan-experts-human-rights-committee-praise-measures-review-judicial>

<sup>16</sup> These comments are derived from the Third periodic report submitted by Turkmenistan under article 19 of the Convention, due in 2020, submitted under the Convention against Torture. [https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/\\_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en](https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en), para. 16, para. 50, para. 122, para. 139, and para. 246.

See also

<https://www.ohchr.org/en/news/2023/03/dialogue-turkmenistan-experts-human-rights-committee-praise-measures-review-judicial>

<sup>17</sup> See attached appendix on the thirty-two.

<sup>18</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 114.44, Sweden.

<sup>19</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.42, United States of America.

<sup>20</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.43, Italy.

<sup>21</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.45, Canada.

<sup>22</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.46, Chile.

<sup>23</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.47, Czechia.

<sup>24</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.48, Canada.

3.2 Recommendations 114.37,<sup>18</sup> 116.42,<sup>19</sup> 116.43,<sup>20</sup> 116.45,<sup>21</sup> 116.46,<sup>22</sup> 116.47,<sup>23</sup> 116.48,<sup>24</sup> 116.52,<sup>25</sup> and 116.55<sup>26</sup> called for the end of enforced disappearances in Turkmenistan, to provide current details on the location/status of those disappeared, to ensure access to legal representatives, and to ensure a prompt and impartial investigation into their individual cases. Ninety-six individuals are still considered disappeared in Turkmenistan by the Prove They Are Alive! campaign. Thirty-two of them have served their complete sentence but have yet to be freed or have any information provided on their status.<sup>27</sup> The government has not issued an official investigation into any of these cases and, as a general practice, rarely releases credible information on the disappeared. These thirty-two individuals can be considered arbitrarily detained since they have served their full sentences.<sup>28</sup>

3.3 Recommendation 116.44<sup>29</sup> called for a study on establishing a national mechanism to prevent torture. There has been no indication that Turkmenistan is working to establish such a mechanism. Instead, the Turkmenistani government states that torture is banned by domestic legislation and that educational programs on prisoner treatment are underway.<sup>30</sup>

---

<sup>18</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 114.44, Sweden.

<sup>19</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.42, United States of America.

<sup>20</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.43, Italy.

<sup>21</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.45, Canada.

<sup>22</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.46, Chile.

<sup>23</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.47, Czechia.

<sup>24</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.48, Canada.

<sup>25</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.52, Poland.

<sup>26</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.55, Germany.

<sup>27</sup> See attached appendix on the thirty-two.

<sup>28</sup> <https://www.ohchr.org/en/special-procedures/wg-arbitrary-detention/mandate>

<sup>29</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.44, Kazakhstan.

<sup>30</sup> These comments are derived from the Third periodic report submitted by Turkmenistan under article 19 of the Convention, due in 2020, submitted under the Convention against Torture. [https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/\\_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en](https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en), para. 28, para. 58, para. 185, and para. 303.

See also

<https://www.ohchr.org/en/news/2023/03/dialogue-turkmenistan-experts-human-rights-committee-praise-measures-review-judicial>

<sup>31</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.49, Netherlands.

3.4 Recommendations 116.49,<sup>31</sup> 116.50,<sup>32</sup> and 116.51<sup>33</sup> called for the ratification of the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance. However, Turkmenistan has yet to sign as a party to the Convention. Despite the international system recognizing enforced disappearances as a form of torture, Turkmenistan allows itself to continue the practice while giving plausibility to deny violating its signatory status to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.

3.5 Recommendations 114.44,<sup>34</sup> 116.53,<sup>35</sup> 116.54,<sup>36</sup> 116.56,<sup>37</sup> and 116.58<sup>38</sup> called for access to, and monitoring of, those forcibly disappeared by the Turkmenistani regime. The regulatory bodies should comprise international and independent domestic institutions, such as the UN and Ombudsperson in Turkmenistan. The recommendations also directly identified the Ovadan Depe prison, which is the single largest institution responsible for holding the disappeared. According to the Turkmenistani regime, the authorities have taken steps to strengthen the office of Ombudsperson, including its position as an independent agency.<sup>39</sup> The Turkmenistani government also maintains that offices such as the Ombudsperson, the OSCE, the UN, and the International Committee of the Red Cross are permitted access to the Turkmenistani prison system at any time upon request.<sup>40</sup> However, there is no tangible evidence that suggests the position of the Ombudsperson has been strengthened or that access is permitted for these listed organizations. Previous discussions between the WGEID and the Turkmenistani authorities over specific cases of the disappeared have been left unanswered by the Turkmenistani side, denying any pathway to oversight and monitoring.

---

<sup>31</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.49, Netherlands.

<sup>32</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.50, France.

<sup>33</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.51, Argentina.

<sup>34</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 114.44, Belgium.

<sup>35</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.53, Norway.

<sup>36</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.54, United States of America.

<sup>37</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.56, Austria.

<sup>38</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review\* Turkmenistan, Third Cycle, 116.58, Estonia.

<sup>39</sup> These comments are derived from the Third periodic report submitted by Turkmenistan under article 19 of the Convention, due in 2020, submitted under the Convention against Torture. [https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/\\_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en](https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en), para. 114

See also <https://www.ohchr.org/en/news/2023/03/dialogue-turkmenistan-experts-human-rights-committee-praise-measures-review-judicial>

<sup>40</sup> These comments are derived from the Third periodic report submitted by Turkmenistan under article 19 of the Convention, due in 2020, submitted under the Convention against Torture. [https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/\\_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en](https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en), para. 26, para. 118, para. 136, para. 179, and para. 180.



#### 4. Turkmenistani Dialogue with the Human Rights Committee

4.1 The most recent exchange between the Turkmenistani government and the UN Human Rights Committee in March 2023<sup>41</sup> echoed the same talking points the Turkmenistani authorities used in their 2020 report to the Convention Against Torture.<sup>42</sup> The Turkmenistani delegation denied the disappeared status of seventy-one<sup>43</sup> individuals, whom the Prove They Are Alive! campaign has identified.<sup>44</sup> The delegation referred to the prisoners as “alive and accounted for,” and that labeling them as disappeared was “inappropriate.”<sup>45</sup> To date, the Prove They Are Alive! campaign has not received or encountered any publicly available data which suggests that these seventy-one are “alive” and “accounted for.” Furthermore, thirty-two of these cases constitute individuals who are being arbitrarily detained, after serving their full sentences.

4.2 Regarding access to the disappeared and previous inquiries by the WGEID, the Turkmenistani delegation denied refusing representatives of the Working Group, claiming that all requested information by the Working Group was provided when asked.<sup>46</sup> However, several communications by the WGEID have been left unanswered, as previously indicated. The delegation claimed the COVID-19 pandemic hindered the possibility of a visit by the Working Group due to safety concerns.<sup>47</sup> They made a similar argument with regard to the Ombudsperson’s activities, stating that the pandemic had made visits “difficult.”<sup>48</sup> While reiterating that there are no restrictions on the Ombudsperson for Turkmenistan, the delegation simultaneously stated that visits could not be permitted without approval, particularly with regard to the Ovadan Depe prison.<sup>49</sup> This is in direct contradiction with the Turkmenistani 2020 report to the Convention Against Torture, which stipulated that the Ombudsperson has unrestricted access to places where individuals may be deprived of liberty, without the need for

---

<sup>41</sup> <https://www.ohchr.org/en/news/2023/03/dialogue-turkmenistan-experts-human-rights-committee-praise-measures-review-judicial>

<sup>42</sup>

[https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/\\_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en](https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en)

<sup>43</sup> Please note that the current number indicated by the Prove They Are Alive! campaign is 71 active current cases, not 72 as mentioned in the council’s questions.

<sup>44</sup> <https://www.ohchr.org/en/news/2023/03/dialogue-turkmenistan-experts-human-rights-committee-praise-measures-review-judicial>

<sup>45</sup> Ibid.

<sup>46</sup> Ibid.

See also

[https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/\\_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en](https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en)

<sup>47</sup> <https://www.ohchr.org/en/news/2023/03/dialogue-turkmenistan-experts-human-rights-committee-praise-measures-review-judicial>

<sup>48</sup> Ibid.

<sup>49</sup> Ibid.

prior notice.<sup>50</sup>

### 5. Prove They Are Alive! Recommendations:

5.1 Many of the recommendations submitted by the Prove They Are Alive! campaign in September 2017<sup>51</sup> were adopted by the reviewing committee during the session of the third cycle of the Universal Periodic Review of Turkmenistan. However, some of the recommendations submitted were not fully adopted by the committee. Additionally, none of the recommendations submitted by the campaign have been properly adopted by Turkmenistan. Those not already mentioned by the committee are as follows:

#### 5.2 RECOMMENDATIONS ON ENFORCED DISAPPEARANCES

10. Abolish the 2003 decree of the Halk Maslakhaty (People’s Council) “On High Treason,” which introduced imprisonment for life as punishment for treason. This decree contradicts the 2010 Criminal Code.<sup>52</sup>

#### 5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS ON TRAVEL BANS

3. Provide an exhaustive and detailed list of possible grounds for travel restrictions; ensure that any such restrictions comply with the principles of proportionality and necessity.
4. Ensure that the procedures for making decisions to impose travel restrictions are clearly articulated and publicly available and provide an exhaustive list of government bodies authorized to make such decisions.
5. Introduce a provision stating that only a competent court may impose a temporary restriction on exiting the country through a judicial procedure.
6. Ensure immediate notification of individuals subject to travel restrictions.
9. In the interim, provide to those banned from foreign travel an official written explanation for the ban including information about appeal procedures.<sup>53</sup>

#### 5.4 RECOMMENDATIONS ON FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION

3. End the campaign to dismantle privately owned satellite dishes and guarantee unimpeded use of satellite dishes and independent and uncensored access to foreign TV and radio broadcasts.<sup>54</sup>

## 6. Recommendations

---

<sup>50</sup> These comments are derived from the Third periodic report submitted by Turkmenistan under article 19 of the Convention, due in 2020, submitted under the Convention against Torture. [https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/\\_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en](https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CAT%2FC%2FTKM%2F3&Lang=en), para. 118 a.

<sup>51</sup> [http://provetheyarealive.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/SUBMISSION-UPR\\_Turkmenistan\\_2017\\_Prove-They-Are-Alive.pdf](http://provetheyarealive.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/SUBMISSION-UPR_Turkmenistan_2017_Prove-They-Are-Alive.pdf)

<sup>52</sup> Ibid, pg. 5.

<sup>53</sup> Ibid, pg 9-10.

<sup>54</sup> Ibid, pg 11.



6.1 In addition to those from the previous UPR, which are mentioned above, we offer the following recommendations:

1. Immediately and unconditionally release those prisoners who have completed their terms and offer reparations to them and their families.
2. Immediately and unconditionally cease the practice of enforced disappearances, allowing prisoners visitation, receipt of letters and packages, access to medical care, and access to legal counsel, in line with the amended Code of Criminal Procedure and the obligations undertaken by Turkmenistan within the Universal Periodic Review.
3. If any individual in the disappeared list has died, provide family members with the death certificate and location of the remains.
4. Provide immediate access to Turkmen prisons, including the high-security Ovadan Depe prison, for independent observers such as the ICRC, relevant mandate holders of UN Special Procedures, human rights NGOs, and other authoritative international bodies such as the OSCE/ODIHR and facilitate a visit by the UN Special Rapporteur on Torture, the Working Group on Arbitrary Detention, and the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances.
5. Immediately initiate judicial reviews of all the court cases of the disappeared in light of the 2010 amendments to the Criminal Code, allowing international monitors to observe the proceedings.
6. Acknowledge the cases of **Ogulsapar Muradova**, **Batyr Berdyev**, **Rustem Dzhumaev**, **Serdar Rakhimov**, and **Boris Shikhmuradov** as cases of enforced disappearance; bring the ruling on Ms. Muradova's death by the Turkmenistani government into agreement with the ruling of the Human Rights Council in 2018 acknowledging responsibility for it and retracting the statement that Ms. Muradova's death was a suicide. The government of Turkmenistan should also conduct an immediate and impartial investigation into those cases raised by the WGEID, and resume dialogue with the WGEID on these cases and all others.
7. Immediately abolish the 2003 decree of the Halk Maslakhaty (People's Council) "On High Treason," which introduced imprisonment for life as punishment for treason. This decree contradicts the 2010 Criminal Code.